

22 November 2023

Rhonda Carr
Micheal Fountain Architects Pty Ltd
2/5 Narabang Way
Belrose NSW 2085

Dear Rhonda,

ALTERATIONS AND ADDITIONS TO THE EXISTING WOOLWICH MARINA – RESPONSE TO DCCEEW REFERRAL COMMENTS

We refer to the Department of Climate Change, Energy, the Environment and Water's (DCCEEW) letter, dated 27 October 2023 regarding the proposed alterations and additions to the existing Woolwich Marina (the proposed development) lodged under DA20230094.

Advisian Pty Ltd has been requested on behalf of the applicant to provide responses in relation to the request for additional information on the self-assessment made under the *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999* (EPBC Act). A response is provided below against each item.

Item 1: How the Cockatoo Island Management Plan has been considered (it is a legislative instrument under the EPBC Act), including Policy 15.

The Cockatoo Island Management Plan 2017 (the Management Plan) was prepared by the Sydney Harbour Federation Trust (Harbour Trust). Section 1 of the Management Plan states that *"the purpose of this Management Plan is to guide the outcomes proposed in the Harbour Trust's Comprehensive Plan, to satisfy the requirements of Schedules 5, 5A, 5B, 7A and 7B of the Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Regulations 2000 (EPBC Regulation) and to be consistent with the World, National and Commonwealth Heritage management principles"*.

Section 2 includes an Aim of the Management Plan that is to *"Enhance views to and from the island"*. The proposed development is designed to retain views to and from Cockatoo Island focusing on its northern side. A supplement to the main Visual Impact Assessment (VIA) has been prepared in November 2023 by Micheal Fountain Architects (MFA) and is attached to form part of the response to DCCEEW. This VIA is discussed in further detail below.

Section 7 of the Management Plan includes a series of Conservation Policies which are derived from the Convict and Dockyard Conservation Management Plans. The proposed development has been considered in Table 1 against the relevant Conservation Policies, including Policy 15.

Table 1 – Policy 15 Considerations

Policy	Comment
<p>Policy 15: Recognise and retain significant views to, from and within the island in its harbour setting; permitting easy recognition and interpretation of buildings, landscape features, and cranes.</p>	<p>The existing Woolwich Marina faces the northern side of Cockatoo Island which along this side features a campground, vegetation (especially the trees) leading up to and on the plateau, the Powerhouse and its chimney, the water tower and glimpses of the South side industrial buildings over the plateau.</p> <p>The initial VIA by MFA (dated May 2023) identifies that <i>"the main visual impact of the proposal will be on the walkway-level views from Kelly's Bush's promenade"</i> and that <i>"the view loss from the walkway resulting from the marina extension is transitory"</i>.</p> <p>The Heritage Impact Statement (Advisian, 2023) concluded that the impact of the proposed development to Cockatoo Island is as follows:</p> <p><i>"The proposed development would have a temporary and moderate visual impact to the heritage items during the construction phase due to the presence of water-based construction vessels and equipment. No physical or direct impacts are anticipated including to the buffer zone. However, a minor visual impact is anticipated during operation to affect the item towards the north-west area of the item whereby static views to the proposed new marina berths can be expected"</i>.</p> <p>The initial VIA determined four locations indicative of places where views to or from Cockatoo Island may be affected. Those locations are identified in the VIA as POS 1 (Kelly's Bush Park – Lookout), POS 2 (Kelly's Bush Park – Foreshore), POS 3 (Cockatoo Island – Foreshore), and POS 4 (Cockatoo Island – Upper Park). The supplement VIA has been prepared to expand on the implications specific to those views and includes additional photomontages.</p> <p>The supplement VIA (MFA, 2023) concludes that:</p> <p><i>"While the proposed expansion will have little to no impact on the views to Cockatoo Island from most areas, it was found that the views from the waters edge of Kellys Bush Park would be somewhat effected [POS 2].</i></p> <p><i>The analysis informed the formulation of design strategies to mitigate the impact on views from Kellys Bush Park to Cockatoo Island.</i></p> <p><i>A number of measures were adopted in the design to ensure that the views to Cockatoo Island from Kellys Bush Park are maintained from all but a small area to the West of the park and therefore the impacts are acceptable"</i>.</p> <p>In this regard, the proposed development has adequately recognised and retained significant views to and from the island from a heritage conservation and visual impact perspective.</p>
<p>a. Investigate opportunities for improving sightlines within the island.</p> <p>b. Interpret important views and viewpoints both on the island and from the mainland.</p> <p>c. Consider the potential impact of works on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Access to significant vantage points on the island; and • Views of the island from the water and surrounding shorelines. 	<p>a. Existing sightlines on the northern side of Cockatoo Island are proposed to be largely maintained, except for from North Western foreshore section of the island. Based on the layout of the marina extension, it is considered that the proposed view corridor along with other mitigations as described in the supplement VIA is an appropriate response noting the visual impacts are transitory.</p> <p>b. Views to and from Cockatoo Island from the mainland will be largely retained except for some views from Kelly's Bush Park and the North Western foreshores of Cockatoo Island. A number of measures have been adopted in the design to ensure that the views to Cockatoo Island from Kelly's Bush Park are maintained from all but a small area as described above and therefore the visual impacts are considered to be acceptable.</p> <p>c. There will be no impacts to access to significant vantage points on the island. Views of the island from the water and surrounding shorelines is largely unaffected. Refer to responses under items b. and c. above.</p>

The Cockatoo Island / Wareamah Draft Master Plan is on public exhibition from 1 November 2023 to 13 December 2023. The Draft Management Plan does not include the above Conservation Policies. However, Section 3.4 identifies that *"the views from the island back across the harbour are distinct in each of the four areas or 'rooms'"*. In particular, it is noted that the *"Northern Apron opens to a narrower river character water body, with a green treed backdrop of harbour parklands in Woolwich"*. The proposed development will not significantly impact this view from Cockatoo Island towards Woolwich including the Horse Paddock and Kelly's Bush Park for the reasons discussed in Table 1.

Item 2: Confirmation that the proposed action will not enter or abut the buffer zone for Cockatoo Island (e.g. using clear imagery).

Section 3.2 of the supplement VIA states (MFA, 2023) that:

"The expansion sits entirely within the existing mooring field and it does not enter or abut the buffer zone of Cockatoo Island. In the general dimension terms the Cockatoo Island Buffer Zone extends 200m from the island and the proposed marina will sit approximately 207m from the island at its closest point".

Section 3.2 includes a supporting figure showing the location of the proposed development and the buffer zone.

Item 3: An adequate assessment of the visual impacts of the proposed action on views to and from Cockatoo Island in Appendix H – Visual Impact Assessment and Appendix B – Digital Photomontages.

A supplement to the main VIA has been prepared in November 2023 by MFA and is provided as part of the response to DCCEEW. The primary focus of the supplement VIA is to assess the visual impact on views to and from Cockatoo Island. It is supported by photomontages.

Item 4: An assessment of potential impacts against the Commonwealth Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1 – Matters of National Environmental Significance and Significant Impact Guidelines 1.2 – Action on, or impacting upon, Commonwealth land and Actions by Commonwealth Agencies.

An assessment of the potential impacts of the proposed development against the relevant sections of Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1 and 1.2 is contained in Tables 2 and 3, respectively. This relates to the following Cockatoo Island heritage listings and the respective heritage values associated with the listings:

- *"Australian Convict Sites (Cockatoo Island Convict Site)"* – World Heritage List.
- *"Cockatoo Island"* – National Heritage List (Place ID: 105928).
- *"Cockatoo Island Industrial Conservation Area"* – Commonwealth Heritage List (Place ID: 105262).

Table 2 – Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1 Considerations

Significant impact criteria for the action	Consideration
World Heritage properties with cultural heritage values (Historic heritage values) An action is likely to have a significant impact on cultural heritage values of a World Heritage property if there is a real chance or possibility that the action will:	
Permanently remove, destroy, damage or substantially alter the fabric of a World Heritage property	There will be no direct or indirect impacts to the fabric of Cockatoo Island.
Extend, renovate, refurbish or substantially alter a World Heritage property in a manner which is inconsistent with relevant values	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.

Significant impact criteria for the action	Consideration
Permanently remove, destroy, damage or substantially disturb archaeological deposits or artefacts in a World Heritage property	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.
Involve activities in a World Heritage property with substantial and/or long-term impacts on its values	There will be no substantial and/or long term impacts on its values. The proposed development will not have a significant impact on the values of the World Heritage property.
Involve construction of buildings or other structures within, adjacent to, or within important sight lines of, a World Heritage property which are inconsistent with relevant values, and	Refer to the responses in Table 1 with regard to impacts to views to and from Cockatoo Island. Further, the proposed development does not enter or abut the World Heritage property buffer zone for Cockatoo Island.
Make notable changes to the layout, spaces, form or species composition in a garden, landscape or setting of a World Heritage property which are inconsistent with relevant values.	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.
National Heritage places with cultural heritage values (Historic heritage values) An action is likely to have a significant impact on natural heritage values of a National Heritage place if there is a real chance or possibility that the action will:	
Permanently remove, destroy, damage or substantially alter the fabric of a National Heritage place in a manner which is inconsistent with relevant values	There will be no direct or indirect impacts to fabric of Cockatoo Island.
Extend, renovate, refurbish or substantially alter a National Heritage place in a manner which is inconsistent with relevant values	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.
Permanently remove, destroy, damage or substantially disturb archaeological deposits or artefacts in a National Heritage place	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.
Involve activities in a National Heritage place with substantial and/or long-term impacts on its values	There will be no substantial and/or long term impacts on its values. The proposed development will not have a significant impact on the values of the National Heritage place.
Involve the construction of buildings or other structures within, adjacent to, or within important sight lines of, a National Heritage place which are inconsistent with relevant values, and	Refer to the responses in Table 1 with regard to impacts to views to and from Cockatoo Island.
Make notable changes to the layout, spaces, form or species composition of a garden, landscape or setting of a National Heritage place in a manner which is inconsistent with relevant values.	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.

In conclusion, no significant impacts are expected to the heritage values of the World Heritage property and National Heritage place as no works are to be undertaken on Cockatoo Island and the proposed development does not obstruct any significant views from Cockatoo Island to the mainland.

Table 3 – Significant Impact Guidelines 1.2 Considerations

Impacts on heritage	Consideration
Is there a real chance or possibility that the action will:	
Permanently destroy, remove or substantially alter the fabric (physical material including structural elements and other components, fixtures, contents, and objects) of a heritage place	There will be no direct or indirect impacts to fabric of Cockatoo Island.
Involve extension, renovation, or substantial alteration of a heritage place in a manner which is inconsistent with the heritage values of the place	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.
Involve the erection of buildings or other structures adjacent to, or within important sight lines of, a heritage place which are inconsistent with the heritage values of the place	No works to Cockatoo Island are proposed.
Substantially diminish the heritage value of a heritage place for a community or group for which it is significant	There will be no substantial diminishing of heritage values.
Substantially alter the setting of a heritage place in a manner which is inconsistent with the heritage values of the place, or	There will be no substantial changes to the setting of the heritage place.
Substantially restrict or inhibit the existing use of a heritage place as a cultural or ceremonial site?	There will be no restrictions to existing uses.

In conclusion, no significant impacts are expected to the heritage values of the Commonwealth Heritage place as no works are to be undertaken on Cockatoo Island and the proposed development does not obstruct any significant views from Cockatoo Island to the mainland.

Yours faithfully,



Claire Jones
Principal Environmental Planner